

# High-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance in microalgae: possible mechanisms and implications for biotechnology and bioremediation

Alexei Solovchenko · Inna Khozin-Goldberg

Received: 23 April 2013 / Accepted: 10 June 2013 / Published online: 26 June 2013  
© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2013

**Abstract** Recent developments in the field of microalgal biotechnology, including CO<sub>2</sub> biomitigation and the discovery of new species of microalgae that are tolerant to extremely high CO<sub>2</sub> levels (40–100 vol%), have renewed interest in the physiological effects and mechanisms of high-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance in photoautotrophs. Photosynthetic apparatus state transitions that increase ATP generation, upregulation of H<sup>+</sup>-ATPases pumping protons out of the cell, rapid shutdown of CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanisms, and adjustment of membranes' fatty acid composition are currently believed to be the key mechanisms governing cellular pH homeostasis and hence microalgae's tolerance to high CO<sub>2</sub> levels, which is especially characteristic of extremophile and symbiotic species. The mechanisms governing acclimation to high CO<sub>2</sub> comprise the subject of this review and are discussed in view of the use of CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment to increase the productivity

of microalgal cultures, as well as the practice of carbon capture from flue gases.

**Keywords** Biomitigation · CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanism · Microalga · pH homeostasis · Response of lipid metabolism

## Introduction

The present-day atmospheric concentration of CO<sub>2</sub> (ca. 0.04 %<sup>1</sup>) is considered to be limiting for photosynthesis (Larkum 2010). In fact, the photosynthetic apparatus (PSA) and, in particular, ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco)—the stromal enzyme that catalyzes the entry of CO<sub>2</sub> into the Calvin–Benson–Bassham (CBB) cycle—seem to be adapted to the much higher CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations encountered by the ancestors of modern photoautotrophs (Kupriyanova and Pronina 2011). As the atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> level gradually declined due to photosynthetic fixation and geochemical processes, photoautotrophic organisms evolved sophisticated CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanisms (CCMs). These mechanisms facilitate CO<sub>2</sub> uptake and increase its

---

A. Solovchenko (✉)  
Department of Bioengineering, Faculty of Biology,  
Moscow State University, GSP-1, 119234 Moscow,  
Russia  
e-mail: solovchenko@mail.bio.msu.ru

I. Khozin-Goldberg  
Microalgal Biotechnology Laboratory, The French  
Associates Institute for Agriculture & Biotechnology  
of Drylands, The Jacob Blaustein Institutes for Desert  
Research, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev,  
Sede-Boker Campus, Midreshet Ben-Gurion,  
84990 Beersheba, Israel

---

<sup>1</sup> Here and in the following, volumetric percentage of CO<sub>2</sub> in the gas mixture used for culture bubbling is specified as this parameter is more manageable and relevant to microalgal biotechnology than CO<sub>2</sub> partial pressure (pCO<sub>2</sub>) in the medium.

concentration near Rubisco by one to three orders of magnitude relative to the atmospheric level, to maintain sufficient photosynthesis (Raven 2010). As a consequence, CO<sub>2</sub> levels as low as 2–5 % are saturating for the overwhelming majority of contemporary photoautotrophs, while higher CO<sub>2</sub> levels often exert deleterious effects on growth and photosynthesis.

The division of microalgae into CO<sub>2</sub>-sensitive and CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant groups is, to a great extent, a matter of convention since CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance varies greatly not only between species, but within a single species as well, depending on growth conditions. In general, species inhibited by <2–5 % CO<sub>2</sub> are considered to be CO<sub>2</sub>-sensitive (intolerant), those that can cope with up to 20 % CO<sub>2</sub> are referred to as CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant, and the species withstanding higher CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations are denoted as extremely CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant; accordingly, CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations of 2–5, 5–20, and 20–100 % are commonly referred to as high, very high, and extremely high, respectively (Miyachi et al. 2003).

Until recently, most studies in the field of microalgal physiology and biotechnology were dedicated to investigating the effects of relatively low (<5 %) CO<sub>2</sub> levels and CCM function, which is now quite well understood (Raven et al. 2008). In contrast, studies on the mechanisms governing tolerance to high CO<sub>2</sub> levels are scarce, even though this phenomenon has been known for over 40 years (Seckbach et al. 1970) and investigations into CO<sub>2</sub> acclimation of different microalgae, including species that are important for biotechnology, have been published (Table 1).

High-CO<sub>2</sub> acclimation is a complex process involving adjustment of numerous, if not all, functions of microalgal cells (Muradyan et al. 2004; Sergeenko et al. 2000). A thorough understanding of its underlying mechanisms is a prerequisite for employing CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment to increase productivity of mass-cultivated microalgae, as well as for efficient CO<sub>2</sub> fixation by microalgae for carbon-capture applications (Kumar et al. 2011; Wang et al. 2008). In particular, the proposed use of neutral lipids of microalgae as biofuel feedstock precursors recently inspired numerous attempts to examine the effect of sparging with gas mixtures having different CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations (from slightly above ambient to 100 %) on neutral lipid (triacylglycerol) production potential of microalgal cultures (Toledo-Cervantes et al. 2013; Yoo et al. 2013).

**Table 1** Examples of high-CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant species of microalgae

Species	Max. CO <sub>2</sub> tolerated (% v/v)	Reference
<i>Cyanidium caldarium</i>	100	Seckbach et al. (1970)
<i>Scenedesmus</i> sp.	80	Hanagata et al. (1992)
<i>Chlorococcum littorale</i>	60	Kodama et al. (1993)
<i>Synechococcus elongatus</i>	60	Miyairi (1995)
<i>Euglena gracilis</i>	45	Nakano et al. (1996)
<i>Chlorella</i> sp.	40	Hanagata et al. (1992)
<i>Eudorina</i> spp.	20	Hanagata et al. (1992)

Adapted from Raven et al. (2008)

The issue of microalgal tolerance to CO<sub>2</sub> is becoming increasingly important in view of the continuous rise in environmental risks imposed by anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> emission. Today, biological (photosynthetic) sequestration by microalgae is thought to be the most environmentally safe and sustainable way of mitigating CO<sub>2</sub> levels (Wang et al. 2008; Huntley and Redalje 2007; Kumar et al. 2011; Yoo et al. 2010; Borowitzka and Moheimani 2013). Indeed, there have been successful attempts at cultivating microalgae using CO<sub>2</sub> from the flue gas of a coal-combusting power plant (see e.g. Koberg et al. 2011). At the same time, considerable difficulties have been encountered in the development of efficient approaches for CO<sub>2</sub> biomitigation, due to insufficient understanding of the physiological effects of, and acclimation to high levels of CO<sub>2</sub>. This situation, along with a considerable rise in the number of publications devoted to cultivation of microalgae under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> levels, raised the need for the present review.

### Acclimation of the photosynthetic apparatus (PSA)

The growth and photosynthesis of sensitive microalgae are largely inhibited by CO<sub>2</sub> at concentrations above 2–5 %. In tolerant species, growth and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation decline at considerably higher CO<sub>2</sub> levels; recovery often occurs after a lag period, depending on the species and the actual CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (Satoh et al. 2002). Such a lag is characteristic of *Chlamydomonas*, for example, but often lacking in *Chlorella* (Miyachi et al. 2003; Baba et al. 2011). However, CO<sub>2</sub>

**Table 2** Growth and CO<sub>2</sub> fixation of high-CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant microalgae

Species or strain	CO <sub>2</sub> (%)	<i>t</i> (°C)	Growth (g l <sup>-1</sup> day <sup>-1</sup> )	CO <sub>2</sub> fixation (g l <sup>-1</sup> day <sup>-1</sup> )	Reference
<i>Chlorococcum littorale</i>	40	30	– <sup>a</sup>	1.0	Iwasaki et al. (1998)
<i>Chlorella kessleri</i>	18	30	0.087	0.163	de Morais and Costa (2007b)
<i>Chlorella</i> sp. UK001	15	35	–	>1	Murakami and Ikenouchi (1997)
<i>Chlorella vulgaris</i> <sup>b</sup>	15		–	0.624	Yun et al. (1997)
<i>Chlorella</i> sp.	40	42	–	1.0	Sakai et al. (1995)
<i>Dunaliella</i> sp. <sup>c</sup>	3	27	0.17	0.313	Kishimoto et al. (1994)
<i>Haematococcus pluvialis</i> <sup>d</sup>	16–34	20	0.076	0.143	Huntley and Redalje (2007)
<i>Scenedesmus obliquus</i>	18	30	0.14	0.26	de Morais and Costa (2007a)
<i>Spirulina</i> sp.	12	30	0.22	0.413a	de Morais and Costa (2007a)

Adapted from Wang et al. (2008)

<sup>a</sup> Not recorded

<sup>b</sup> In artificial wastewater

<sup>c</sup> Accumulates β-carotene at high salinities

<sup>d</sup> In production-scale photobioreactor

tolerance of the same species may vary considerably in reports by different groups (Table 2).

The much-studied extremophile chlorophyte, *Chlorococcum littorale*, isolated from saline ponds, retains the capacity for rapid growth at CO<sub>2</sub> levels of up to 60 % (Miyachi et al. 2003). Studies of *C. littorale* have demonstrated that transfer to a high-CO<sub>2</sub> state brings about a rapid state transition of the PSA in this species (Demidov et al. 2000). A similar response was then found in other microalgae (Sergeenko et al. 2000). The high-CO<sub>2</sub>-induced transition of the PSA from state I to state II was suggested to increase cyclic electron transport over photosystem (PS) I and to generate the added amounts of ATP necessary for support of pH homeostasis in the algal cell (Miyachi et al. 2003), and see the section on pH homeostasis further on). A common reason for the state transition in the PSA is reduction of the plastoquinone pool due to accumulation of NADPH (Antal et al. 2013). This situation usually arises when the dark reactions of photosynthesis are inhibited to a certain extent by a stressor (Strasser et al. 2004), such as elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Accordingly, the increase in the PSI/II ratio suggests that high-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance requires, in particular, an increase in the size of the PSI light-harvesting antenna. Indeed, corresponding changes have been recorded in the PSA of CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant microalgae within several days of their transfer to high-CO<sub>2</sub> conditions (Satoh et al. 2002). Notably, the changes in the PSI/II ratio were

reversible: the ratio could return to its initial level, probably due to a decrease in ATP demand as a result of overall acclimation of the microalgal cell to high CO<sub>2</sub> and/or a decline in the CCM activity (Miyachi et al. 2003). In contrast, CO<sub>2</sub>-intolerant species (such as *Dunaliella salina*) lack the state-transition response and display signs of PSI damage under high-CO<sub>2</sub> conditions (Muradyan et al. 2004).

Interestingly, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> promoted high-light-induced photoinhibition in sensitive species (e.g. in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*) but alleviated it in CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant species (*Chlorella pyrenoidosa* or *Scenedesmus obliquus*) in comparison with the same cultures grown under atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> levels; at the same time, the high CO<sub>2</sub>-adapted cultures recovered from the photoinhibition more rapidly (Yang and Gao 2003).

### Robustness of pH homeostasis in the cell

The rapid inhibition of photosynthesis observed under high-CO<sub>2</sub> conditions could be a consequence of inactivation of the key enzymes of the Calvin cycle due to acidification of the stromal compartment of the chloroplast (Krause and Weis 1991) under high-CO<sub>2</sub> stress. This suggestion was confirmed by Pronina et al. (1993) who demonstrated, using vital <sup>31</sup>P-NMR, that the pH of the cytoplasm in the CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant microalga *C. littorale* does not drop below 7.0, even during

cultivation under extreme (40 %) CO<sub>2</sub> levels (Miyachi et al. 2003).

#### Active transport of H<sup>+</sup>

Taking into account these findings, it is obvious that efficient control of intracellular pH is essential for high-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance. Such control might be achieved by pumping the protons from the cytoplasm into the vacuoles, for example, via consumption of the surplus ATP generated as a result of cyclic electron transport by the ATPase and H<sup>+</sup>-pyrophosphatase associated with the tonoplast (Gogarten and Taiz 1992).

Normally, microalgal cells grown under low-CO<sub>2</sub> conditions are characterized by a certain level of CCM activity, including that of diverse carbonic anhydrase (CA) enzymes with different cellular localizations. Therefore, a considerable drop in pH is expected at the beginning of these cells' high-CO<sub>2</sub> acclimation, prior to CCM downregulation. This could explain the overlap of the peak demand for ATP with the acclimation period and the aforementioned reversal of the changes in PSI/II ratio thereafter. On the other hand, cultivation of microalgae at elevated CO<sub>2</sub> levels often leads to an increase in size and/or number of vacuoles in the cytoplasm (Pronina et al. 1993). Sasaki et al. (1999) showed that vacuolization of the cytoplasm in *C. littorale* is accompanied by significant induction of H<sup>+</sup>-ATPase activity. The magnitude of this increase was strongly correlated with the rate of photosynthesis during acclimation to extremely high CO<sub>2</sub> levels.

An important factor of CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance is the ability of microalgal cells to increase the pH of the medium during active growth via nitrate uptake. Alkalization of the medium is believed to compensate, to a considerable extent, for the acidification effect of high CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. This mechanism operates in *Emiliania huxleyi* (Fukuda et al. 2011) for example, as well as in a symbiotic *Desmodesmus* sp. (Solovchenko et al. unpublished). Obviously, a sufficient supply of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> would be necessary for efficient acclimation to high CO<sub>2</sub> and carbon capture from flue gases by the microalgal cultures.

#### Shutdown of the CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanism (CCM)

Satoh et al. (2002) demonstrated a drop in intracellular pH within 1 h of transferring *C. littorale* cells growing

in low CO<sub>2</sub> to 40 % CO<sub>2</sub>. This effect was eliminated by treatment of the cells with ethoxzolamide, a membrane-permeable CA inhibitor. Cultivation of the low-CO<sub>2</sub>-adapted microalgal cells at elevated CO<sub>2</sub> brought about a considerable decline in CCM activity. In *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*, degradation of CA takes ca. 7 days (Baba and Shiraiwa 2012) and occurs in parallel with inhibition of active transport of bicarbonate (Bhatti and Colman 2008). This decline is often reversible: CCM activity returns to its initial level upon transfer of the cells to atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. This process is thought to be regulated by CCM1/CIA5, the 290- to 580-kDa protein complex containing a zinc-finger domain (Fukuzawa et al. 2001). In contrast, cells of microalga adapted to 5 % CO<sub>2</sub> that possess no detectable intra- or extracellular CA activity do not display a growth lag upon transfer to extreme levels of (40 %) CO<sub>2</sub> (Satoh et al. 2002). Interestingly, the microalgae naturally adapted to growth under acidic conditions in the presence of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations such as *Synura petersenii* or *Tessellaria volvocina* apparently lack a CCM (Raven 2010; Bhatti and Colman 2008). In particular, cells of these species lack plasmalemma-bound CA, they are unable to take up bicarbonate, and their Rubisco is characterized by high affinity to CO<sub>2</sub> (Bhatti and Colman 2008). Interestingly, availability of alternative (organic) carbon sources leads to a decline in CA activity. It is thus apparent that the ability to swiftly downregulate CCM (or its effective lack) is an important prerequisite for attaining high CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance.

#### Effects on lipid biosynthesis and fatty acid (fatty acid) composition

Many research groups are currently engaged in the isolation of novel CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant strains and investigations into their ability to accumulate storage lipids when sparged with high, or even pure, CO<sub>2</sub> (Kumar et al. 2011; Yoo et al. 2013; López et al. 2013; Solovchenko et al. 2013; Toledo-Cervantes et al. 2013). In general, a moderate (2–5 %) increase in CO<sub>2</sub> stimulates both growth and lipid accumulation by microalgal cells (Muradyan et al. 2004). For example, a green microalga isolated from a spring in Cuatro Ciénegas, Mexico, and morphologically identified as *Scenedesmus obtusiusculus*, tolerated 10 % CO<sub>2</sub>; its

neutral lipid content increased from 15 to 55 % of dry weight (DW) as the CO<sub>2</sub> level increased from 0.04 to 5 %, with a corresponding decrease in total carbohydrates (Toledo-Cervantes et al. 2013). In another study, a *Scenedesmus* sp. and *Chlorella* sp., both isolated from a Sonoran desert mineral spring, grew and tolerated exposures to up to 20 % CO<sub>2</sub> applied continuously in batch reactors (Westerhoff et al. 2010). Another chlorophyte, *Ettlia* sp., showed high growth rate and lipid content at 5–10 % CO<sub>2</sub>; the highest lipid productivity (80 mg l<sup>-1</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>) and total lipid content (up to 42 % of DW) was obtained with administration of 5 % CO<sub>2</sub> (Yoo et al. 2013). Increasing CO<sub>2</sub> from 1.5 to 5 % enhanced total lipid content in the biomass of the green alga *Parietochloris incisa* (Shuuluka et al. unpublished work). CO<sub>2</sub> levels higher than 20–30 % generally lead to a decline in reserve-lipid biosynthesis, often with overall inhibition of the culture's growth (Chiu et al. 2009). At the same time, CO<sub>2</sub> levels characteristic of flue gases (13–20 %) sometimes cause no inhibition, as in the case of *Botryococcus braunii* (Ge et al. 2011), or even promote lipid accumulation (Yoo et al. 2010). Thus, Tang et al. (2011) attempted to cultivate *S. obliquus* SJTU-3 and *Chlorella pyrenoidosa* SJTU-2 with 0.03–50 % CO<sub>2</sub>. Whereas both microalgae demonstrated optimal growth potential at 10 % CO<sub>2</sub>, sustained, albeit slower, growth was recorded at 50 % as well. Total lipid content in the stationary cultures showed a moderate but gradual increase with the increase in CO<sub>2</sub> supply from ambient 0.03 to 50 % in *S. obliquus*, while increasing CO<sub>2</sub> from 5 to 50 %, did not exert any prominent effect on total lipid content in *Chlorella pyrenoidosa*. Notably, no significant differences were found between cultures of *Tetraselmis suecica* CS-187 and a *Chlorella* sp. supplemented with either pure CO<sub>2</sub> or untreated flue gas from coal-fired power plant, in biomass and lipid productivities at optimal pH (Moheimani 2013).

The availability of other carbon sources has a strong effect on lipid accumulation under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. In particular, the effects of high or low inorganic carbon concentrations (CO<sub>2</sub> and bicarbonate) on neutral lipid and starch accumulation were studied in the model alga *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* during nitrogen depletion under photoautotrophic conditions (Gardner et al. 2013). Under low CO<sub>2</sub> (0.04 %), carbon limitation resulted in reduced accumulation of both storage products - triacylglycerol (TAG) and starch; at

5 % CO<sub>2</sub>, the highest amount of TAG was produced, however under these conditions rapid TAG accumulation was followed by degradation (probably following acclimation to the elevated CO<sub>2</sub> level). Under high bicarbonate supplementation, the cell cycle was arrested and sustainable accumulation of both TAG and starch was recorded. In mixotrophic cultures (grown on an organic carbon source), raising CO<sub>2</sub> levels impaired the algae's capacity for import and assimilation of glycerol (Sforza et al. 2012). Obviously, lipid (TAG in particular) biosynthesis represents a sink for the excess products of carbon fixation, which is especially important under stressful conditions causing cessation of cell division (Solovchenko 2012; Hu et al. 2008). One could further speculate that the ability to channel the excess photosynthates to the biosynthesis of energy-rich compounds such as TAG may, in some situations, contribute to high-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance of microalgae.

Apart from changes in the proportions of the major lipid classes, bubbling with gas mixtures enriched in CO<sub>2</sub> often leads to an increase in fatty acid percentages of DW, even in CO<sub>2</sub>-sensitive species, e.g. by 30 % in *D. salina* at 10 % CO<sub>2</sub> (Muradyan et al. 2004); in CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant species, this effect is even stronger (Luo and Al-Dahhan 2011). One might assume that under high CO<sub>2</sub> conditions, the flux of de-novo-synthesized fatty acids toward assembly of acyl lipids is enhanced. An increased level of C<sub>18</sub> polyunsaturated fatty acids in total lipids was reported to occur with increasing CO<sub>2</sub> concentration, indicating increasing unsaturation of chloroplast lipids (Tang et al. 2011).

At the same time, CO<sub>2</sub>-sensitive species respond to even short-term (1 day) exposure to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> level by a decline in the fatty acid unsaturation index, suggesting inhibition of fatty acid desaturation and C<sub>16</sub>-to-C<sub>18</sub> elongation (Muradyan et al. 2004; Yoo et al. 2010). However, given the increased amount of fatty acid precursors that accumulated in the lipids of *D. salina* under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions, the authors (Muradyan et al. 2004) suggested an alternative explanation: that fatty acid-modifying activities might not be affected and are not sufficient to convert the enhanced influx of de novo-produced fatty acids. As a result, an increase in the proportion of saturated fatty acids and monounsaturated oleic acid (18:1) occurred in *D. salina* along with a rise in the ω3/ω6 fatty acid ratio and in the proportion of the major chloroplast galactolipid, monogalactosyl diacylglycerol (MGDG),

while the second major galactolipid—digalactosyl diacylglycerol (DGDG)—decreased (Muradyan et al. 2004). Importantly, high amounts of saturated palmitic acid (16:0), a product of de-novo fatty acid synthesis, accumulated in MGDG under high CO<sub>2</sub>. These results suggest possible rearrangements in chloroplast membranes in high-CO<sub>2</sub>-sensitive microalgae. The non-bilayer-forming MGDG is typically characterized by a high abundance of polyunsaturated fatty acids which forces it to adopt a so-called hexagonal II structure; hence high levels of saturated fatty acids in MGDG are likely to affect phase behavior of the lipids in the thylakoid and envelope membranes.

### Implications for mass cultivation of microalgae

It is obvious from the above considerations that CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment is an efficient technique for enhancing the productivity of microalgal cultures, provided that a proper approach is taken. In particular, it is essential to establish an optimal CO<sub>2</sub> feeding rate to the culture. This rate is usually limited by CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance (especially by its low-pH-related component) as described above. Aside from other factors, the efficiency of CO<sub>2</sub> utilization by microalgal cells is limited by mass transfer between the gaseous phase and the liquid culture medium. On the other hand, one cannot increase the rate of sparging of the culture and/or the intensity of agitation above a certain limit imposed by shear stress without negatively influencing culture growth. Separate concerns exist regarding the capture of CO<sub>2</sub> directly from flue gases, which usually contain some nitrogen and sulfur oxides that form acids upon dissolution in the culture medium, as well as other toxic pollutants. Therefore, flue gases require special treatment, e.g. pre-filtering and neutralization, before they are fed to microalgae (López et al. 2013). Collectively, these circumstances call for specific features in the design of dedicated photobioreactors for CO<sub>2</sub> capture by microalgae. For example, an important aim is maximizing contact between the sparging gas and the culture to achieve the most efficient mass transfer. Taking into account the necessity to avoid shear stress, a closed photobioreactor system with mixing by airlift and recycling of the sparging gas seems to be the best choice, although efficient open systems (raceway-based) for carbon capture have been implemented as well (Koberg et al.

2011). In other respects (achieving high photic volume, absence of stagnation zones, removal of O<sub>2</sub> formed in the course of photosynthesis, etc.), the construction of these photobioreactors should be governed by the common design principles outlined in recent papers (Greenwald et al. 2012; Sieblist et al. 2011a, b; Carvalho et al. 2011).

### Conclusion and outlook

A considerable number of microalgal species appear to be tolerant to moderate levels of CO<sub>2</sub>; at the same time, species which are able to withstand extreme CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations (20–40 % and higher) are quite rare. Nevertheless, high-CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant microalgae need to be isolated for the development of efficient CO<sub>2</sub>-capture methods. Summarizing the experimental data obtained to date, one can conclude that CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance in microalgae is achieved via several mechanisms. These include the responses preventing acidification of the chloroplastic stromal compartment and cytoplasm to maintain sufficient Rubisco activity. First, state transition of the PSA increases ATP generation which is spent on maintaining a suitable pH by active transport. Second, the ability to rapidly and reversibly shut down the CCMs operating under atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> levels but facilitating the pH drop in microalgal cells under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> seems to be of considerable importance. Third, various adjustments in lipid metabolism provide for optimal balance of source and sink under stressful conditions, as well as for swift rearrangements of PSA membranes.

Mechanisms of high-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance have important implications for microalgal biotechnology. The insights obtained in the studies of these mechanisms reveal additional strain-selection criteria for the development of efficient microalgal cultivation methods based on high-CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment for diverse applications, especially in the case of mixotrophic cultures. In particular, one should look closely for the presence of the responses outlined above. Promising sources of high-CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant isolates include extremophiles from geysers and thermal springs (López et al. 2013). An additional benefit of exploiting thermophilic species is the reduced energy input required for cooling and hence more cost-efficient carbon capture, since flue gases are discharged at high temperature. Symbiotic microalgae may also have a great potential for carbon capture (Solovchenko et al.

2013). Another potential mechanisms (but, to the best of our knowledge, not yet explored) approach would involve artificial down-regulation of the CCM in well-known biotechnologically important species to improve their CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance without harming their ability to accumulate value-added compounds.

**In conclusion**, despite the considerable progress achieved to date, our understanding of the mechanisms of high-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerance in microalgae is far from complete and requires a considerable research effort. Application of the advanced ‘omics’ tools in this field seems to be promising for improving current microalgal biotechnologies for environmental protection and obtaining diverse bioproducts.

**Acknowledgments** AS gratefully acknowledges financial support from the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation (contract #14.515.11.0052). Authors would like to thank Ms. Camille Vainstein for professional language editing.

## References

- Antal TK, Kolacheva A, Maslakov A, Riznichenko GY, Krendeleva TE, Rubin AB (2013) Study of the effect of reducing conditions on the initial chlorophyll fluorescence rise in the green microalgae *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Photosynth Res* 114:143–154
- Baba M, Shiraiwa Y (2012) High-CO<sub>2</sub> response mechanisms in microalgae. In: Najafpour M (ed) *Advances in photosynthesis—fundamental aspects*. InTech, Rijeka, pp 299–320
- Baba M, Suzuki I, Shiraiwa Y (2011) Proteomic analysis of high-CO<sub>2</sub>-inducible extracellular proteins in the unicellular green alga, *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Plant Cell Physiol* 52:1302–1314
- Bhatti S, Colman B (2008) Inorganic carbon acquisition in some synurophyte algae. *Physiol Plant* 133:33–40
- Borowitzka MA, Moheimani NR (2013) Sustainable biofuels from algae. *Mitig Adapt Strateg Glob Chang* 18:13–25
- Carvalho AP, Silva SO, Baptista JM, Malcata FX (2011) Light requirements in microalgal photobioreactors: an overview of biophotonic aspects. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 89:1275–1288
- Chiu SY, Kao CY, Tsai MT, Ong SC, Chen CH, Lin CS (2009) Lipid accumulation and CO<sub>2</sub> utilization of *Nannochloropsis oculata* in response to CO<sub>2</sub> aeration. *Bioresour Technol* 100:833–838
- de Morais MG, Costa JAV (2007a) Biofixation of carbon dioxide by *Spirulina* sp. and *Scenedesmus obliquus* cultivated in a three-stage serial tubular photobioreactor. *J Biotechnol* 129:439–445
- de Morais MG, Costa JAV (2007b) Isolation and selection of microalgae from coal fired thermolectric power plant for biofixation of carbon dioxide. *Energy Convers Manage* 48:2169–2173
- Demidov E, Iwasaki I, Sato N (2000) Short-term responses of photosynthetic reactions to extremely high-CO<sub>2</sub> stress in a high-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerant green alga *Chlorococcum littorale* and an intolerant green alga *Stichococcus bacillaris*. *Russ J Plant Physiol* 47:622–631
- Fukuda Sy, Suzuki I, Hama T, Shiraiwa Y (2011) Compensatory response of the unicellular-calcifying alga *Emiliania huxleyi* (Coccolithophorales, Haptophyta) to ocean acidification. *J Oceanogr* 67:17–25
- Fukuzawa H, Miura K, Ishizaki K, Kucho K, Saito T, Kohinata T, Ohyama K (2001) *Ccm1*, a regulatory gene controlling the induction of a carbon-concentrating mechanism in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* by sensing CO<sub>2</sub>. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 98:5347–5352
- Gardner RD, Lohman E, Gerlach R, Cooksey KE, Peyton BM (2013) Comparison of CO<sub>2</sub> and bicarbonate as inorganic carbon sources for triacylglycerol and starch accumulation in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Biotechnol Bioeng* 110:87–96
- Ge Y, Liu J, Tian G (2011) Growth characteristics of *Botryococcus braunii* 765 under high CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in photobioreactor. *Bioresour Technol* 102:130–134
- Gogarten J, Taiz L (1992) Evolution of proton pumping ATPases: rooting the tree of life. *Photosynth Res* 33:137–146
- Greenwald E, Gordon JM, Zarmi Y (2012) Physics of ultra-high bioproductivity in algal photobioreactors. *Appl Phys Lett* 100:143703–143704
- Hanagata N, Takeuchi T, Fukujū Y, Barnes DJ, Karube I (1992) Tolerance of microalgae to high CO<sub>2</sub> and high temperature. *Phytochemistry* 31:3345–3348
- Hu Q, Sommerfeld M, Jarvis E, Ghirardi M, Posewitz M, Seibert M, Darzins A (2008) Microalgal triacylglycerols as feedstocks for biofuel production: perspectives and advances. *Plant J* 54:621–639
- Huntley M, Redalje D (2007) CO<sub>2</sub> mitigation and renewable oil from photosynthetic microbes: a new appraisal. *Mitig Adapt Strateg Glob Chang* 12:573–608
- Iwasaki I, Hu Q, Kurano N, Miyachi S (1998) Effect of extremely high-CO<sub>2</sub> stress on energy distribution between photosystem I and photosystem II in a high-CO<sub>2</sub> tolerant green alga, *Chlorococcum littorale* and the intolerant green alga *Stichococcus bacillaris*. *J Photochem Photobiol B Biol* 44:184–190
- Kishimoto M, Okakura T, Nagashima H, Minowa T, Yokoyama S-Y, Yamaberi K (1994) CO<sub>2</sub> fixation and oil production using micro-algae. *J Ferment Bioeng* 78:479–482
- Koberg M, Cohen M, Ben-Amotz A, Gedanken A (2011) Biodiesel production directly from the microalgae biomass of *Nannochloropsis* by microwave and ultrasound radiation. *Bioresour Technol* 102:4265–4269
- Kodama M, Ikemoto H, Miyachi S (1993) A new species of highly CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant fast-growing marine microalga suitable for high-density culture. *J Mar Biotechnol* 1:21–25
- Krause G, Weis E (1991) Chlorophyll fluorescence and photosynthesis: the basics. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* 42:313–349
- Kumar K, Dasgupta CN, Nayak B, Lindblad P, Das D (2011) Development of suitable photobioreactors for CO<sub>2</sub> sequestration addressing global warming using green algae and cyanobacteria. *Bioresour Technol* 102:4945–4953
- Kupriyanova E, Pronina N (2011) Carbonic anhydrase: enzyme that has transformed the biosphere. *Russ J Plant Physiol* 58:197–209

- Larkum AWD (2010) Limitations and prospects of natural photosynthesis for bioenergy production. *Curr Opin Biotechnol* 21:271–276
- López J, Quijano G, Souza TO, Estrada J, Lebrero R, Muñoz R (2013) Biotechnologies for greenhouse gases (CH<sub>4</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O, and CO<sub>2</sub>) abatement: state of the art and challenges. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 97:2277–2303
- Luo HP, Al-Dahhan MH (2011) Airlift column photobioreactors for *Porphyridium* sp. culturing. Part II. Verification of dynamic growth rate model for reactor performance evaluation. *Biotechnol Bioeng* 109:942–949
- Miyachi S, Iwasaki I, Shiraiwa Y (2003) Historical perspective on microalgal and cyanobacterial acclimation to low- and extremely high-CO<sub>2</sub> conditions. *Photosynth Res* 77:139–153
- Miyairi S (1995) CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation in a thermophilic cyanobacterium. *Energy Convers Manage* 36:763–766
- Moheimani N (2013) Inorganic carbon and pH effect on growth and lipid productivity of *Tetraselmis suecica* and *Chlorella* sp (Chlorophyta) grown outdoors in bag photobioreactors. *J Appl Phycol* 25:387–398
- Muradyan EA, Klyachko-Gurvich GL, Tsoglin LN, Sergeenko TV, Pronina NA (2004) Changes in lipid metabolism during adaptation of the *Dunaliella salina* photosynthetic apparatus to high CO<sub>2</sub> concentration. *Russ J Plant Physiol* 51:53–62
- Murakami M, Ikenouchi M (1997) The biological CO<sub>2</sub> fixation and utilization project by RITE—screening and breeding of microalgae with high capability in fixing CO<sub>2</sub>. *Energy Convers Manage* 38:S493–S497
- Nakano Y, Miyatake K, Okuno H, Hamazaki K, Takenaka S, Honami N, Kiyota M, Aiga I, Kondo J (1996) Growth of photosynthetic algae *Euglena* in high CO<sub>2</sub> conditions and its photosynthetic characteristics. In: International Symposium on Plant Production in Closed Ecosystems 440, pp 49–54
- Pronina N, Kodama M, Miyachi S (1993) Changes in intracellular pH values in various microalgae induced by raising CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. In: Furuya M (ed) XV international botanical congress, Yokohama, p 419
- Raven JA (2010) Inorganic carbon acquisition by eukaryotic algae: four current questions. *Photosynth Res* 106:123–134
- Raven J, Cockell C, De La Rocha C (2008) The evolution of inorganic carbon concentrating mechanisms in photosynthesis. *Philos Trans B* 363:2641–2650
- Sakai N, Sakamoto Y, Kishimoto N, Chihara M, Karube I (1995) *Chlorella* strains from hot springs tolerant to high temperature and high CO<sub>2</sub>. *Energy Convers Manage* 36:693–696
- Satoh A, Kurano N, Senger H, Miyachi S (2002) Regulation of energy balance in photosystems in response to changes in CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations and light intensities during growth in extremely-high-CO<sub>2</sub>-tolerant green microalgae. *Plant Cell Physiol* 43:440–451
- Seckbach J, Baker FA, Shugarman PM (1970) Algae thrive under pure CO<sub>2</sub>. *Nature* 227:744–745
- Sergeenko T, Muradyan E, Pronina N, Klyachko-Gurvich G, Mishina I, Tsoglin L (2000) The effect of extremely high CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on the growth and biochemical composition of microalgae. *Russ J Plant Physiol* 47:632–638
- Sforza E, Cipriani R, Morosinotto T, Bertucco A, Giacometti GM (2012) Excess CO<sub>2</sub> supply inhibits mixotrophic growth of *Chlorella protothecoides* and *Nannochloropsis salina*. *Bioresour Technol* 104:523–529
- Sieblist C, Hägeholz O, Aehle M, Jenzsch M, Pohlscheidt M, Lübbert A (2011a) Insights into large-scale cell-culture reactors: II. Gas-phase mixing and CO<sub>2</sub> stripping. *Biotechnol J* 6:1547–1556
- Sieblist C, Jenzsch M, Pohlscheidt M, Lübbert A (2011b) Insights into large-scale cell + culture reactors: I. Liquid mixing and oxygen supply. *Biotechnol J* 6:1532–1546
- Solovchenko A (2012) Physiological role of neutral lipid accumulation in eukaryotic microalgae under stresses. *Russ J Plant Physiol* 59:167–176
- Solovchenko A, Chivkunova O, Semenova L, Selyakh I, Sheherbakov P, Karpova E, Lobakova E (2013) Stress-Induced changes in pigment and fatty acid content in the microalga *Desmodesmus* sp. isolated from a White Sea hydroid. *Russ J Plant Physiol* 60:313–321
- Strasser R, Tsimilli-Michael M, Srivastava A (2004) Analysis of the chlorophyll *a* fluorescence transient. In: Papageorgiou G, Govindjee (eds) Chlorophyll a fluorescence: a signature of photosynthesis. Springer, Dordrecht, pp 321–362
- Tang D, Han W, Li P, Miao X, Zhong J (2011) CO<sub>2</sub> biofixation and fatty acid composition of *Scenedesmus obliquus* and *Chlorella pyrenoidosa* in response to different CO<sub>2</sub> levels. *Bioresour Technol* 102:3071–3076
- Toledo-Cervantes A, Morales M, Novelo E, Revah S (2013) Carbon dioxide fixation and lipid storage by *Scenedesmus obtusiusculus*. *Bioresour Technol* 130:652–658
- Wang B, Li Y, Wu N, Lan C (2008) CO<sub>2</sub> bio-mitigation using microalgae. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 79:707–718
- Yang Y, Gao K (2003) Effects of CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations on the freshwater microalgae, *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*, *Chlorella pyrenoidosa* and *Scenedesmus obliquus* (Chlorophyta). *J Appl Phycol* 15:379–389
- Yoo C, Jun S-Y, Lee J-Y, Ahn C-Y, Oh H-M (2010) Selection of microalgae for lipid production under high levels carbon dioxide. *Bioresour Technol* 101:S71–S74
- Yoo C, Choi GG, Kim SC, Oh HM (2013) *Ettlia* sp. YC01 showing high growth rate and lipid content under high CO<sub>2</sub>. *Bioresour Technol* 127:482–488
- Yun YS, Lee SB, Park JM, Lee CI, Yang JW (1997) Carbon dioxide fixation by algal cultivation using wastewater nutrients. *J Chem Technol Biotechnol* 69:451–455